

Debate Guidelines

EECS 395/495: Web Information Retrieval
and Extraction

(thanks to Aleksandar Kuzmanovic,
Northwestern EECS)

Defense (1)

- 20 minutes; should present as if it were his/her own
- The point is to make a compelling case why the contribution is significant.
 - the context of the contribution,
 - prior work,
 - If an older paper: how the work has influenced the research community or industry's directions (impact)
 - If newer paper: arguments for the potential impact

Defense (2)

- should go well beyond a paper "summary"
- The defense should not critique the work other than to try to pre-empt attacks from the offense (e.g., by explicitly limiting the scope of the contribution).
- The defense should also try to look up related work to support their case

Offense (1)

- 10 minutes;
- Should critique the work, and make a case for
 - missing links, unaddressed issues, lack of impact, inappropriateness of the problem formulation, etc.
- The more insightful and less obvious the criticisms the better
- While the offense should prepare remarks in advance, they should also react to the points made by the defense.
- **Hint:** The offense should also try to look up related work to support their case

Debate

- The defense and offense will be allowed follow up arguments,
- The class will question either side either for clarifications or to add to the discussions and controversy and make their own points on either side.
- Use Powerpoint (feel free to use existing presentations from the Web)